CHILDREN AND THE 2004 INDIAN OCEAN TSUNAMI

Child Protection Evaluation Findings in Indonesia, Sri Lanka and the Maldives

Neil Boothby
Professor of Global Health
Columbia University
Objectives:

- Provide outcome-impact analysis of the child protection program (2005-2008)
- Examine DAC evaluation criteria as applied to the child protection sector
- Provide evidence-based conclusions, lessons learned and recommendations

Focus: child protection program’s work strands—early response-recovery-early development

Key design component: compare different interventions with one another; “old” vs. “new”; or where a similar program does not exist

Methods: sequential mixed methods and phased sampling
Today’s Focus:
Is it Possible to Respond to Child Protection in Emergencies in Ways that also Accelerate Protective Systems Development?

Build Back Better Strategy

- Did it succeed? Overview of Outcome-Impact Results
- A Few Good Practice Exemplars
- A Few Common Deficits
- A Few Lessons Learned
- 3 Global Recommendations
Did Systems Emerge?
Aceh Baseline

Limited baseline available: Conflict-Marshall Law; Weak information systems-data that was available destroyed in Tsunami; use of retrospective baselines

Children without Family Care
- 170 Pantis (2004)
- 860 Registered Dayah (2004)

Psychosocial support
- Social Services volunteer based: episodic incentives for government projects
- 2003-2004, series of ad hoc psychosocial training workshops for teachers, health workers, women and religious leaders received psychosocial training
- One mental health hospital (Banda Aceh) for province

Exploitation and Abuse
- No rehabilitation or correction centers for children
- No separate detention facilities for children--investigation, prosecution and trial.
Aceh Child Protection Program Logic

*Key outputs do not exactly mirror outputs in the programme log frame, but attempt to capture the programme logic essence.*
Did Systems Emerge?  
Overview Aceh

Rudimentary emergency responses evolved into substantial protective systems for children in tsunami-affected areas.

Emergence of a child protection system is in large part due to early linkage of the dual objectives of responding to immediate needs of vulnerable groups of children and welfare and legal systems-building for all children.

Early response tracing and reunification and safe space programs paved the way for:
- New child care and placement policies and practices
- Favorable shift in government policy away from financial support for orphanages only to substantial support of livelihoods to prevent child-family separations
- New government-civil society partnerships to provide integrated social services at sub-district level
- Emerging professional social service staff: 240 TKSK covering 215 sub-districts paid under the provincial parliament budget
- New university-based school of social work—human resource development
Government Commitment to Child Protection
Aceh, Indonesia

The graph shows the increasing budget for child protection in Aceh, Indonesia, from 2005 to 2008. The budget started at Rp0 in 2005 and increased to Rp8,000,000,000,000 in 2008.
Good Practice Exemplar
Exploitation and Abuse
Aceh

Early Response
- Policewomen trained and deployed to barracks-children centers and key transit areas to monitor movement of separated children out of province; 50 by April 2005; 195 by October 2005.

Recovery - Early Development: early responses evolved into:
- Children’s desks in police departments throughout province
- Diversion program adopted (PPA) throughout province and a separate child court in Banda Aceh
- Integrated (legal and medical) service centers (PPT) for victims of exploitation, abuse and violence
- Restorative Justice Working Group—police, judge-social welfare and NGO members—now an NGO
Aceh
Exploitation and Abuse System Outcomes

• **22 Women’s and Children’s Police Desks** — provincial and district police offices (2005 and 2007)

• Before PPA standardization, *only 8%* of children reported that a lawyer or NGO representative was with them while they were questioned by the police

• After PPA standardization, *76%* of children reported they were accompanied during questioning

• After PPA policy standardization and trainings, *71% of children diverted* from jail in program areas. Before PPA standardization, only *33% diverted*
Aceh
Exploitation and Abuse Systems
Outcomes

- Before the PPT, only 7% of women reported that the purpose of their interview at the hospital was explained to them. After the PPT, 53% reported the purpose of the interview was explained.

- Before the PPT, no women reported monitoring or follow-up about their condition. After, 67% reported follow-up.
Did Systems Emerge

Sri Lanka Baseline

Had legislative measures in place to improve the protection of children from domestic violence, child labor and commercial sexual exploitation—and some programs aimed at protecting and promoting the rights of children.

Displacement and pervasive indiscriminate violence was feeding a climate of fear and significant disparity in vulnerable areas of the North and East.

Source and destination country for trafficking for the purposes of involuntary servitude and commercial sexual exploitation.

Tsunami placed an exceptional demand on the state social work and social welfare systems, particularly in the north-east, where recruitment and retention of staff was difficult.
Did Systems Emerge?
Overview Sri Lanka

Comparisons of “new” and “old” programs suggest that significant child protection system development has occurred.

Emergence of a child protection system is in large part due to early linkage of the dual objectives of responding to immediate needs of vulnerable groups of children and welfare and legal systems-building for all children.

The ability to rapidly shift to address new protection problems is a distinct element of a child protection system in the conflict zones of Sri Lanka.

Promising practice exemplars emerged:
- Case conferencing and district level review committees are impacting rates of institutional care.
- Batticaloa’s safe house set a higher standard of protection for abused, exploited and neglected children.
- Social Service Centers facilitate case conferencing and integrated social service assistance (however, a number of centers are in remote locations which limits their utility).
Government Commitment to Child Protection
Sri Lanka


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Children's Secretariat</th>
<th>Nat'l Plan of Action for Children</th>
<th>National Child Protection Authority</th>
<th>Probation &amp; Child Care Services</th>
<th>Children Nutrition Program</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>75.9</td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>28.5</td>
<td>26.4</td>
<td>35.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>100.3</td>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>35.7</td>
<td>38.2</td>
<td>53.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>135.4</td>
<td>38.2</td>
<td>598.5</td>
<td>7.9</td>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>145.5</td>
<td>7.9</td>
<td>328.5</td>
<td>34.1</td>
<td>53.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

0 200 400 600 800 1000 1200

2005 2006 2007 2008
Sri Lanka
Separated Children--Voluntary Homes

2005: majority of separated, unaccompanied, orphaned children received family placements in aftermath of tsunami

2006-2007: There was a wave of secondary separations—and increase in voluntary homes—that neither the government nor the international community was prepared to deal with.
Trends in Institutionalization of Abused, Exploited and Neglected Children 2005-2008

- Case Conf. in Batti
- Court Cases in Batti
- Court Cases in Galle
- Case Conf. in Galle
Sri Lanka
Psychosocial
Safe Spaces and Children’s Clubs

- Safe Spaces focused on children in camps and displaced communities
  - Total Number of Tsunami Camps in Sri Lanka
    - 265
  - Batticaloa - 36
  - Galle - 17
  - Total - 53
  - In both districts approximately 10,000 Children reached by June 2005

- Children’s clubs—as determined by the evaluation’s exercise—address at least 2 and sometimes 3 community well-being priorities:
  - School performance
  - Supportive family
  - Non-alcoholic father
  - Recreation and play
  - Peer friendships

2008: 130 clubs in East and South: most have reduced activities—CBO involvement, livelihood and self-help fundraising are key to sustainability
Sri Lanka
Psychosocial
School Based Response

Teachers and schools provided psychosocial support to children

- **Children Reached**
  - **2005** - 1282
  - **2006** - 1060
  - **2007** - 1019
  - **2008** - 967
  - **TOTAL** 4328

- Challenge: Holistic approach must be maintained to maximize support to children

- Challenge: Principal support and proper guidance teacher-student ratios must be maintained

- Challenge: Professionalizing PS Teachers

### Number of Trained Teachers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>District</th>
<th>2007 Male</th>
<th>2007 Female</th>
<th>2008 Male</th>
<th>2008 Female</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
<th>Gender Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Galle</td>
<td>141</td>
<td>283</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>424</td>
<td>28% 51%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Batticaloa</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>162</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>121</td>
<td>442</td>
<td>7% 14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td>240</td>
<td>445</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>121</td>
<td>866</td>
<td>28% 51% 7% 14%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Source: Ministry/Department of Education)
Shortcomings
Children Without Family Care

Early response assessment approaches and methodologies were limited

Survival, protection and livelihood linkages were not thoroughly addressed

Global “separated, unaccompanied, and orphaned” categorization was not a helpful guide to vulnerability

Shortcomings were evident in:

• Inaccurate early estimations of separated children
• Under-preparedness to deal with secondary child-family separations
• Limited scope of children without family care program
Children Without Family Care: It Was An Effective Response

Aceh Example
But

It Was Also Limited in Scope

Aceh Example

- Informally reunited with family (estimate) - 17%
- Formally reunited with Family through FTR process - 83%
Shortcomings
Sustainability

Poor outcome results from stand alone projects that were not adequately linked to traditional, community, and/or sub-district/district mechanisms

• Aceh Examples: NGO psychosocial program in tsunami communities and ad hoc projects in conflict zones

• Sri Lanka Examples: atrophying of children's clubs—better sustainability performance of CBO compared to INGOs

• Maldives Examples: community perceptions of “no improvement” and cessation of many outer island programs and NGOs
Sustainability of child protection systems depends on its ability to address poverty and livelihood imperatives—Neglected selection of partners that could supply a livelihood component with funds from other donors

A holistic approach to child protection—which requires a commitment to ensure that all components of child rights and well-being are addressed across sectors—did not consistently take place

Senior Management may not have fully understand—or supported—a child protection systems approach:

- SL’s child protection budget decreased 53% from 2007-08—a more severe cut-back than other sectors
- Aceh drastic downsizing of protection staff—threatens unique child protection and social welfare systems achievements
Lessons Learned

Dual objectives of responding to immediate needs and system-building can be envisioned as two complementary work strands.

Work on the second system-building objective can be seen as an incremental process running simultaneously to emergency assistance provision.

Significant challenge is to navigate the balance in investment between these two work strands, so that attention to the immediate and pressing protection needs of especially vulnerable children is not diminished.

Sri Lanka also demonstrates how “system flexibility” is a hallmark of a responsive child protective system in a chronic humanitarian emergency.
Lessons Learned

Building a protective environment system is a long term venture

Short term nature of emergency funding is normally a major obstacle—which in the tsunami context—was overcome by generous funding and long term engagement

Effective protection environment building must be a shared priority between emergency and development actors—and dialogue on transitions to a national development track—needs to take place during the emergency phase
Global Recommendations

Promote child protection systems as a key concept in the humanitarian sector

- Entering the protective environment paradigm through the narrow focus of an emergency response can jump start protective system’s advances

- Study these lessons critically and increase global commitment to building-strengthening child protection systems in emergencies
Global Recommendations

Commitment to child protection systems building will require rethinking emergency policies and practices

This will be accompanied by the need to rethink emergency response policy and practices, including how UNICEF:

- Understands core commitments to child protection in emergencies
- Designs and implement emergency assessments
- Plans and implement emergency programs
- Anticipates required funding from amount and duration perspectives
- Uses advocacy in humanitarian emergencies
- Trains and orient emergency staff
- Approaches early recovery and re-development work
- Approaches child protection research and evaluations
Global Recommendations

*Promote a skills based capacity building initiative for child protection staff as part of the ongoing inter-agency child protection in emergency assessment initiative*

Methodologies to:

- Establish prevalence rates on key child protection concerns
- Engage affected populations in identifying what risk and resilience means in a given culture and a given crisis

Emergency standby roster workshops could be arranged; regional learning initiatives promoted; and distance training packages developed